

TENDER REPORT & ANALYSIS
Worthing Crematorium, Horsham Road, Findon, West Sussex
Office Remodelling

Date: March 2018

Job No: 526550

Exp. Ref: 58217-6010



TENDER REPORT

For

Office Remodelling & Associated Works

To

Worthing Crematorium, Horsham Road, Findon, West Sussex

Prepared by:

Roy Wood

On behalf of:

Worthing Borough Council

Town Hall

Chapel Road

WORTHING

West Sussex

BN11 1HA



PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to consider tenders received under single stage tendering procedures for the Remodelling of Offices & Associated Works to Worthing Crematorium, Findon, West Sussex.

To make a recommendation with a view to tender acceptance and request approval to proceed to contract.

All tenders were invited on a schedule of rates basis, using the In-tend e-portal, with MEAT (Most Economically Advantageous Tender) scoring ratios stated as 30% Price and 70% Quality.

Approval is sought to accept the recommendation for the appointment of Fowler Building Contractors Ltd, as stated at Item 2.1 below.

1.0 DIGEST

1.1 The project entails the remodelling of staff offices, reception area and waiting room, and washroom facilities.

1.2 Project Budget £337,500.00

1.3 Contract Sum £316,945.00

1.4 Estimated Date of Commencement Tuesday 8th May

1.5 Estimated Date of Completion To be agreed prior to contract

1.6 Contract Duration 12 weeks

1.7 Contractor: Fowler Building Contractors Ltd

2.0 RECOMMENDATION

2.1 To accept the overall highest ranking tender received from Fowler Building Contractors Ltd, in the sum of £316,945.00 +vat, and that this contractor is appointed as Principal Contractor, subject to the placement of a contract deed and development of the Construction Phase Health & Safety Plan, prior to commencement of any works on site



3.0 PROPOSED WORKS

The proposed works include for the following:

- Fully revised office layout, to include kitchenette
- Relocated, enlarged reception area, with memorialisation display
- Conversion of existing store room and adjacent Vestry into new waiting room
- New store room and Vestry created within existing external courtyard
- Fully refurbished and Part M compliant customer WC
- Creation of additional staff only WC

4.0 TENDER

4.1 A group of five, suitably qualified contractors, with known relevant experience of working within occupied and sensitive environments, were invited to submit tenders.

4.2 Tenders were issued and returned electronically via the In-tend e-portal. Upon return, all documentation received into the In-tend system was electronically transferred/downloaded by Roy Wood (Building Surveyor) on the 16th March 2018, with individual tender price submissions formally transferred across to the Tender Summary Form accordingly.

The tendering contractors were:-

- 1) Cheesmur Building Contractors Ltd
- 2) Fowler Building Contractors Ltd
- 3) John Farrington & Co. Ltd

Messrs Tasker Catchpole Ltd and A&F Pilbeam Ltd both opted to withdraw from the tender process prior to the date of return; the former having gone into receivership during the tender period.

4.3 Tenders were invited on the basis of a fixed price contract for a period of 12 weeks.

Contractor	Tender Value
Cheesmur Building Contractors Ltd	£293,403.00
Fowler Building Contractors Ltd	£316,945.00
John Farrington & Co. Ltd	£473,729.00

4.4 All the above tenders are exclusive of professional fees and VAT, currently rated at 20%.

4.5 Costs associated with the delivery, set up, dismantling and collection of temporary buildings to serve staff decanted prior to commencement do not form part of the tendered sums above.



Technical Services has engaged the services of Messrs Portakabin Ltd, who are to provide said buildings for the duration of the project.

Furthermore, specialist works to run temporary and final ICT network and telephony connections attract an additional cost. These works are to be facilitated by Messrs Aspire Networks Solutions Ltd, in coordination with Adur & Worthing's ICT department.

Brief details can be found in the table below.

Work item	Supplier	Value (quoted)
Supply of temporary buildings (i.e. office, meeting room and conveniences).	Portakabin Ltd	£9,955.00
Installation and configuration of temporary network switch – prior to works commencement and at completion.	Adur & Worthing Councils – ICT	£Nil
All ICT and telephony cabling works – both temporary and new.	Aspire Network Solutions Ltd	£14,849.00

- 4.6 The subjects of this report are the two highest ranking tenders from a total of the three competitive tenders received. Tender evaluation details are attached to this report in **Appendix A**.
- 4.7 None of the highest ranking two tenders analysed contained any qualifications. However, Cheesmur Building Contractors Ltd provided a series of provisional sums for scheduled work items they felt were insufficiently detailed within the tender documentation. These sums form part of their priced submission.
- 4.8 Analysis of the priced rates provided by Fowler Building Contractors Ltd revealed an arithmetical discrepancy in the contractor's favour to the value of £1,095.00. A request was sent to the contractor's estimating team for consideration and feedback in relation to this apparent error on 29th March 2018. It was agreed by the contractor's representatives that an error did indeed exist and that, in line with JCT guidance, the tender figure and/or relevant rates within the priced schedules were to be suitably amended and re-submitted to the Council; a covering letter to also be provided.
- 4.9 Details of Contract Preliminaries pricing (tender documents, Section I) were requested of Fowler Building Contractors Ltd on 20th March 2018. This information was provided promptly and has been further analysed in support of the lump sum tender price submitted, details of which appear acceptable.



- 4.10 The overall range between the two lowest (price) tenders is £23,542.00 or approximately 7%.
- 4.11 This variance in price can, in part, be explained by each contractor's pricing of individual or 'grouped' work items (elements). However, it would appear that Fowler Building Contractors Ltd has placed a greater onus on the delivery of certain elements outside of 'normal' working hours as stated within the Contract Preliminaries. This is seen as a key consideration, given the sensitivity of the environment in which works are to take place.
- 4.12 By MEAT tender process this project has now been fully market tested. The MEAT evaluation process was undertaken relative to a pre-informed 30% price and 70% quality score assessment, this process has arrived at a recommended tender as submitted by Fowler Building Contractors Ltd, in the sum of £316,945.00.
- 4.13 By MEAT tender analysis on the two highest ranking tenders Fowler Building Contractors Ltd has demonstrated a keen desire to secure the contract; as such it is recommended that the tender submitted by Fowler Building Contractors Ltd is accepted.

5.0 FINANCE & INSURANCE

- 5.1 The project is to be funded by Worthing Borough Council (Environmental Services) Capital Funds from the 2018/2019 budget.
- 5.2 The Council's Finance team has provided details concerning the recent trading status and credit rating of Fowler Building Contractors Ltd; this information was limited to the last filed accounts available, dated 31st December 2016. The financial report produced by 'Creditsafe' shows that the Contractor has been trading for nearly twenty years and, as at year end 2016, had a credit rating of 69 out of 100 – considered to be *low risk*.

Given the relatively historic nature of the information provided, consideration has been given to the requesting of a copy of the Contractor's summary of accounts to 31st December 2017; details pending.

- 5.3 The company has provided details of their Public Liability Insurance Cover, which meets this Councils current requirement of £10,000,000.

6.0 DESIGN & SUPERVISION

- 6.1 Administration and services include for a Contract Administrator and Principal Designer. These roles will be fulfilled by officers within Technical Services' Surveying & Design team.



7.0 HEALTH & SAFETY - CONSTRUCTION DESIGN & MANAGEMENT REGULATIONS (CDM)

7.1 Due to the duration of the contract and the nature of the works, all of the CDM Regulations 2015 will apply as detailed within the Pre-Tender Health & Safety Plan. As such, once appointed, the successful contractor will be required to develop their Construction Phase Health & Safety Plan to the satisfaction of the Principal Designer. This must be sufficiently completed prior to any site activities taking place, to enable commencement of the works.

8.0 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPLICATIONS

8.1 None identified.

9.0 COMPANY REFERENCES

9.1 Fowler Building Contractors Ltd has provided details of previous relevant experience within its completed tender submission schedule and throughout its (quality) method statement responses. Referee contact details are also set out, although at the time of writing, it is not considered necessary to seek additional information and/or feedback from these individuals.

9.2 Fowler Building Contractors Ltd is a known quantity to officers within Technical Services, and has provided tenders for previous capital projects.

10.0 POST TENDER DISCUSSIONS

10.1 Discussions have taken place with both Fowler Building Contractors Ltd and Cheesmur Building Contractors Ltd concerning their approach to 'out of hours' working during the contract term. Responses are outlined within the 'Method Statement Evaluation Matrix', included in **Appendix A**. Both contractors were also advised at the time of discussion that their respective tenders were under consideration.

11.0 THE PROJECT TEAM

11.1 Adur & Worthing Councils – Technical Services, Surveying & Design

Project Manager **Roy Wood**

11.2 Principal Designer

Organisation **Technical Services – Surveying & Design**



11.3 **Contractor**

Organisation

Fowler Building Contractors Ltd



ADUR & WORTHING
COUNCILS

APPENDIX A – BREAKDOWN ANALYSIS OF TENDERS RECEIVED

Office Remodelling & Associated Works

Worthing Crematorium, Horsham Road, Findon, West Sussex

Evaluation Matrix



ADUR & WORTHING
COUNCILS

Worthing Crematorium - Office Remodelling - Overall Evaluation Score Sheet			
Technical 70% Weighting			
Supplier	Cheesmur	Fowler	Farrington
Weighted quality score	44	51	0
Cost of Service 30% Weighting			
Supplier	A	B	C
Cost based on contract specification	£293,403.00	£316,945.00	£473,729.00
Lowest Score % of bid price	100	93	62
Price Weighting	30	30	30
Weighted Cost Score	30	28	19
Total weighted score	74	79	19
Overall Ranking	2nd	1st	3rd

Lowest Price	£293,403.00
---------------------	--------------------

Budget - £337,500

Bidders List	
A	Cheesmur
B	Fowler
C	Farrington

*Scoring was undertaken by two officers from Technical Services (Building Surveyors) and the Bereavement Services Manager

Tender Analysis (computation)



Job number: 526550

Issue Date: April 2018

TENDER ANALYSIS - Worthing Crematorium - Office Remodelling

Item	Description	'Cheesmur'	Comments	'Fowler'	Comments	'Farrington'	Comments
S.1	Preliminaries	£ 26,703.14		£ 42,000.00		Not currently under consideration.	
S.3	Building Schedule of Works <i>As numerated within the tender documentation</i>	-		-			
3.0.1	General Items						
3.0.2							
3.0.3							
3.0.4							
3.0.5					£ 1,500.00		
3.0.6					£ 3,800.00		
3.0.7							
3.0.8					£ 1,500.00		
3.0.9							
3.0.10							
3.0.11					£ 500.00		
3.0.12					£ 220.00		
3.0.13					£ 300.00		
3.0.14					£ 120.00		
3.0.15			-	-	£ 500.00	-	-
3.0.16							
3.0.17							
3.0.18							
3.0.19							
3.0.20							
3.0.21							
3.0.22							
3.0.23							
3.0.24							
3.0.25							
3.0.26							
3.0.27							
3.0.28							
3.1.1	Statutory Requirements & Recommendations						
3.2.1	Temporary Works	£ 500.00		£ 200.00			
3.2.2		£ 500.00		£ 350.00			
3.2.3		£ 1,939.77		£ 1,500.00			
3.2.4		£ 564.42		£ 150.00			
3.2.5		£ 107.49		£ 200.00			
3.2.6		£ 3,674.01		£ 2,925.00			
3.2.7				£ 1,500.00			



3.2.8		£	537.50		£	1,000.00			
3.2.10					£	500.00			
3.3.2		£	161.25		£	100.00			
3.3.3		£	250.00		£	100.00			
3.3.4					£	1,500.00			
3.3.5		£	1,000.00						
3.3.7									
3.3.8									
3.3.9					£	100.00			
3.3.10		£	322.50		£	420.00			
3.3.11		£	3,130.40		£	2,200.00			
3.3.12		£	406.59		£	300.00			
3.3.13		£	145.13		£	280.00			
3.3.14		£	432.50		£	450.00			
3.3.15		£	345.43		£	225.00			
3.3.16		£	438.71		£	333.00			
3.3.17		£	2,582.50		£	1,850.00			
3.3.18		£	601.14		£	800.00			
3.3.19		£	91.38		£	175.00			
3.3.20		£	16.13		£	60.00			
3.3.21		£	86.00		£	300.00			
3.3.22		£	612.98		£	325.00			
3.3.23		£	177.38		£	225.00			
3.3.24	C20: Demolition/stripping out	£	317.13		£	120.00			
3.3.25		£	91.38		£	100.00			
3.3.26		£	37.63		£	70.00			
3.3.27		£	91.38		£	80.00			
3.3.28		£	120.83		£	180.00			
3.3.29		£	18.81		£	70.00			
3.3.31		£	91.38		£	180.00			
3.3.32		£	177.81		£	160.00			
3.3.33		£	188.13		£	225.00			
3.3.34		£	134.97		£	50.00			
3.3.35					£	150.00			
3.3.36					£	50.00			
3.3.37					£	100.00			
3.3.38		£	407.64		£	680.00			
3.3.40		£	193.50		£	225.00			
3.3.41		£	129.00		£	100.00			
3.3.42		£	188.08		£	50.00			
3.3.43		£	188.08		£	20.00			
3.3.44		£	188.08		£	100.00			
3.3.45				Ref. 3.7.12	£	50.00			
3.3.46		£	100.00		£	50.00			
3.3.47					£	50.00			



3.4.3				£	1,800.00			
3.4.4		£	215.00			£	1,500.00	
3.4.5								
3.4.6								
3.4.7								
3.4.8								
3.4.9								
3.4.10								
3.4.11	D20: Excavation and filling							
3.4.12								
3.4.13								
3.4.14		£	331.10					
3.4.15						£	850.00	
3.4.16								
3.4.18		£	1,573.80			£	1,200.00	
3.4.19		£	385.93			£	700.00	
3.5.2		£	925.58			£	1,600.00	
3.5.3		£	148.35			£	80.00	
3.5.4		£	1,299.91			£	300.00	
3.5.5	E10: In-situ concrete					£	100.00	
3.5.6		£	886.81			£	680.00	
3.5.7		£	317.13			£	200.00	
3.5.8		£	252.63			£	180.00	
3.6.3								
3.6.4								
3.6.5								
3.6.6								
3.6.7								
3.6.8								
3.6.9								
3.6.10	F10: Brick/block walling (inc. F30: Sundry / F31: Purpose made)	£	406.05			£	225.00	
3.6.11		£	276.15			£	385.00	
3.6.12		£	604.33			£	950.00	
3.6.13						£	300.00	
3.6.14						£	180.00	
3.6.16		£	107.50					
3.6.17		£	26.88			£	120.00	
3.6.19		£	180.75			£	900.00	
3.7.2	G10: Structural steel framing	£	1,007.47			£	1,850.00	
3.7.4		£	258.55			£	380.00	
3.7.5		£	401.93			£	1,200.00	
3.7.6	G20: Carpentry/timber framing/first fix	£	36.08			£	150.00	
3.7.7		£	58.74			£	150.00	
3.7.8		£	260.71			£	180.00	
3.7.9						£	280.00	



3.7.10		£ 161.22		£ 420.00			
3.7.11		£ 250.00		£ 200.00			
3.7.12		£ 250.00		£ 300.00			
3.7.13		£ 151.48		£ 180.00			
3.7.14		£ 151.48		£ 480.00			
3.7.15		£ 62.11		£ 225.00			
3.7.16		£ 151.48		£ 300.00			
3.7.17			Ref. 3.7.11	£ 180.00			
3.7.18		£ 151.48		£ 300.00			
3.7.19		£ 151.48		£ 180.00			
3.7.20		£ 151.48		£ 150.00			
3.8.3		£ 1,924.05		£ 600.00			
3.8.4	H20: Rigid sheet cladding (inc. H21: Timber)	£ 1,910.38					
3.8.6		£ 241.83		£ 300.00			
3.8.7		£ 241.84		£ 595.00			
3.9.2							
3.9.3							
3.9.4							
3.9.5							
3.9.6							
3.9.7							
3.9.8							
3.9.9							
3.9.10							
3.9.11							
3.9.12							
3.9.13	J: Waterproofing			£ 6,500.00			
3.9.14							
3.9.15							
3.9.16							
3.9.17							
3.9.18							
3.9.19							
3.9.20							
3.9.21							
3.9.22							
3.9.23							
3.9.24							
3.9.26		£ 74.82					
3.9.27	J40: Flexible sheet tanking/damp proofing	£ 66.11					
3.9.28		£ 19.08		£ 800.00			
3.9.31		£ 5,117.00					
3.9.32	J41: Reinforced bitumen membrane roof covering						
3.9.34							
3.9.35							



3.9.36							
3.9.37							
3.9.39							
3.9.41							
3.9.42							
3.9.43							
3.9.44							
3.9.46							
3.9.47							
3.9.49			Ref. 3.7.12	£	1,500.00		
3.10.2	K10: Linings/sheathing/dry partitioning						
3.10.3							
3.10.4							
3.10.5							
3.10.6							
3.10.7							
3.10.8							
3.10.9		£	5,800.70				
3.10.10		£	1,376.54				
3.10.11		£	334.86				
3.10.12		£	625.87				
3.10.13		£	154.80		£	8,262.00	
3.10.14	£	387.00					
3.10.15	£	319.21					
3.10.16	£	264.39					
3.10.17	£	354.75		£	800.00		
3.10.18	£	8,254.93		£	7,000.00		
3.10.19							
3.10.20							
3.10.21				£	195.00		
3.10.23	K11: Rigid sheet flooring/sheathing/decking/sarking/linings/casings	£	645.00		£	720.00	
3.10.24		£	96.75		£	300.00	
3.10.25		£	300.00		£	180.00	
3.11.2	L10: Windows/rooflights/screens/louvres	£	564.34		£	800.00	
3.11.3		£	1,299.68		£	1,500.00	
3.11.4		£	6,267.05		£	3,000.00	
3.11.5					£	400.00	
3.11.6					£	200.00	
3.11.7					£	100.00	
3.11.8		£	161.25				
3.11.10	L20: Doors/shutters/hatches	£	2,660.52				
3.11.12		£	806.21		£	7,650.00	
3.11.13		£	924.47				
3.11.14		£	360.10				
3.11.15		£					



3.11.16		£	1,214.71			£	3,800.00				
3.11.17											
3.11.18		£	8,522.60			£	5,000.00				
3.11.19		£	5,399.73			£	3,000.00				
3.11.20											
3.12.2	M10: Cement based levelling/wearing screeds	£	268.75								
3.12.3		£	608.88								
3.12.4		£	103.20								
3.12.5		£	698.75								
3.12.6		£	104.92			£	1,500.00				
3.12.7		£	1,279.25								
3.12.8											
3.12.10	M20: Plastered/rendered/roughcast coatings	£	860.00								
3.12.11		£	306.38			£	3,500.00				
3.12.12		£	263.38								
3.12.13		£	1,333.00								
3.12.14											
3.12.17	M50: Rubber/plastic/cork/lino/carpet tiling/sheet	£	3,870.00								
3.12.18						£	2,800.00				
3.12.19											
3.12.20											
3.12.22		£	1,707.10			£	1,050.00				
3.12.23		£	2,386.50			£	3,900.00				
3.12.24	£	268.74			£	250.00					
3.12.26	M60: Painting/clear finishes	£	3,027.20								
3.12.27											
3.12.28											
3.12.29											
3.12.30						£	6,500.00				
3.12.31											
3.12.32											
3.12.33											
3.13.2	N10: General fixtures/furnishings/equipment	£	1,639.17								
3.13.3											
3.13.4											
3.13.5											
3.13.6							£	2,500.00			
3.13.7											
3.13.8											
3.13.9		£	376.23			£	400.00				
3.13.10		£	128.99			£	300.00				
3.13.11		£	96.74			£	100.00				
3.13.12		£	139.74			£	100.00				
3.13.13		£	85.99			£	50.00				
3.13.14		£	21.50			£	50.00				



3.16.19		£	551.48					
3.16.20		£	955.68					
3.16.21					£	800.00		
3.16.22								
3.16.24		£	107.50					
3.16.25								
3.16.27		£	268.75					
3.16.28								
3.17.0	S: Piped supply systems, see S.4 (Mechanical Specification)							
3.18.0	U: Ventilation/air conditioning systems, see S.4 (Mechanical Specification)							
3.19.0	V: Electrical supply/power lighting systems, see S.5 (Electrical Specification)							
3.20.2					£	500.00		
3.20.3								
3.21.2	Z22: Sealants				£	320.00		
3.21.3								
3.21.5					£	200.00		
S.4	Mechanical Specification	£	67,182.02		£	67,000.00		
S.5	Electrical Specification	£	46,318.23		£	48,000.00		
S.8	Contingency & Dayworks	£	32,518.00		£	25,440.00		

Tender Total	£	293,403.02
Tender Submission	£	293,403.00
Discrepancies	-£	0.02

£	316,945.00
£	316,945.00
£	-

Information only.
£ 473,729.00

Overall Range of lowest **X** Tenders: £ 23,542.00
 Percentage Range of Tenders: 56%



TENDER ANALYSIS - Worthing Crematorium - Office Remodelling

Item	Description	'Cheesmur'	Comments	Item	Description	'Fowler'	Comments	'Farrington'	Comments
	Preliminaries	£ 26,703.14				£ 42,000.00		Not currently under consideration.	
	Contract Supervision								
A	Working Foreman	£ 9,675.00			Access	£ 2,400.00			
B	Labourer	£ 5,805.00			Plant and tools	£ 1,500.00			
C	Health & Safety Inspections	£ 241.89			Supervision	£ 9,000.00			
	Welfare Facilities				Temporary power and water connections	£ 1,200.00			
A	Oasis unit	£ 387.00			Phone	£ 450.00			
B	Secure store	£ 193.56			Insurances	£ 1,000.00			
C	2+1 flush toilet, inc. servicing	£ 1,032.00			CDM	£ 1,500.00			
D	Transport containers	£ 1,612.50			Site accommodation	£ 5,200.00			
	Services & Facilities				Skips	£ 3,200.00			
A	Site electricity connection	£ 537.50			Management	£ 1,800.00			
B	Site water connection	£ 268.75							
C	Power costs	£ 129.00			Overheads and profit	£ 14,750.00			Preliminaries are generally comparable to Cheesmur, until OH&P is introduced.
D	Water costs	£ 129.00							
E	Mobile telephone	£ 129.00			<i>Prelims without OH&P - £27,250.00</i>				
F	Safety, health and welfare	£ 129.00							
G	CDM documentation	£ 645.00							
H	Storage of materials	£ 129.00							
I	Additional skips	£ 3,547.56							
J	Cleaning	£ 322.50							
K	Protection of the work	£ 322.50							
L	Small plant and tools	£ 258.00							
	Temporary Works								
A	Access scaffolding	£ 537.50							
B	Internal scaffolding / bandstands	£ 268.75							
C	Cheesmur sign boards	£ 107.50							
D	Directional signs	£ 26.88							
	Employers Requirements								
A	Considerate Contractors	£ 268.75							
B	Contract Bond	£ -	Not required?						



Preliminaries Total	£ 26,703.14
Preliminaries (Submission)	£ 26,703.14
Discrepancies	£ -

£ 42,000.00
£ 42,000.00
£ -

Information only.
£ 473,729.00